

### 2017/SOM3/AHSGIE/005

Agenda Item: 4.1

# Draft APEC Roadmap on Internet and Digital Economy – As of 23 Aug 2017

Purpose: Consideration Submitted by: Co-Convenors



5<sup>th</sup> Ad Hoc Steering Group on the Internet Economy Meeting Ho Chi Minh City, Viet Nam 25-26 August 2017

Document Version 8/23/2017: This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

#### APEC INTERNET AND DIGITAL ECONOMY ROADMAP

1
2
3

### **BRIEF INTRODUCTION / BACKGROUND**

4 5

> 6 7

> 8

9

10

11

In 2014, the APEC Leaders formally recognized the role of the Internet Economy in promoting innovative development and increasing economic participation. They endorsed the APEC Initiative of Cooperation to Promote Internet Economy and instructed Ministers and officials to discuss the Internet Economy further, promote member economies' cooperation on developing the Internet Economy, and facilitate technological and policy exchanges to bridge the digital divide. Lenovo1 ln 2015, APEC Leaders and Ministers welcomed the establishment of an Ad Hoc Steering Group to guide the discussion on issues arising from the Internet Economy. [Lenovo2]

12 13 14

Observing established guidelines focusing on practical economic cooperation, respecting the diversity of APEC members, the objectives of the Ad Hoc Steering Group are to:

16 17 18

15

Discuss issues related to the Internet and Digital Economy and propose cooperative activities on Internet and Digital Economy-related projects and initiatives between APEC fora and sub-fora; and

20 21 22

23

24 25

26

19

In collaboration with relevant APEC fora and subfora, organize the development of a cross-APEC work program for endorsement by Senior Officials and consideration by Minister and Leaders, for coordinating cross-cutting APEC initiatives that promote economic growth through the Internet and Digital Economy; encourage cooperation across APEC for a and subfora, and build an open and cooperative environment. [Lenovo3]

27 28 29

In 2016, the SOM endorsed the proposal for the AHSGIE Chair to circulate a consultation paper on drafting a Roadmap on APEC Internet Economy. [Lenovo4]

30 31 32

15 May Drafting Note: APEC Secretariat to review consistency with quoted texts, otherwise the reference should be "Internet and Digital Economy"

33 34 35

36

37 38 The APEC Roadmap on Internet and Digital Economy builds on previous initiatives and is intended to [JPN/US:highlight theprovide a comprehensive framework of][ PRC/AUS: provide a comprehensive framework of US: PRC/AUS: provide a comprehensive framework of [Lenovos] highlight the] key areas and actions to facilitate technological and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>The Terms of Reference (TOR) of the Ad Hoc Steering Group on the Internet Economy and Illustrative Scope of Cooperation (2015/SOM3/AHSGIE/002 and 2015/SOM3/AHSGIE/003).

#### (DRAFT Ver 08-23)

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

policy exchanges among member economies and to promote innovative, inclusive and sustainable growth, as well as to bridge digital divide in the APEC region.

41 42

**15 May Drafting Note:** To discuss China's proposal [Lenovo6]: [CN: provide a comprehensive and coherent framework by 202X]

43 44 45

46

47

48

49

50

51

52

53

54

Given the evolving nature of the Internet and Digital Economy, these areas should not be seen as capturing the full nature of the Internet and Digital Economy. This Roadmap is [US: a living [RUS: living guiding] document that will advise APEC working groups on potential areas of collaboration [MAS: and to achieve the overall APEC agenda, including for \_]digital trade [RUS: digital trade the Internet and Digital Economy [Lenovo7]]. Collaboration with the digital trade experts within working groups is] [Lenovo8] [PRC US: a living document that will advise APEC working groups on potential areas of collaboration for digital trade. Collaboration with the digital trade experts within working groups is] [Lenovo8] an important contribution to [PRC:, and would provide broad guidance to the work to] further promote the development and growth of the Internet and Digital Economy in APEC.

55 56 57

> 58 59

> 60

61

[RUS/PRC: Recognizing the evolving nature of the internet and digital economy, Aacknowledging the variety ofeconomic and social circumstances across APEC economies, and respecting the principles of security and trust in the Internet and Digital Economy, APEC Economies will focus their work on the following Roadmap priority areas. [Lenovo10]

62 [AUS/US/RUS][Lenovo11]: Acknowledging and respecting the principles of security and trust in the Internet and Digital Economy, APEC Economies will focus their work on the

64 following Roadmap priority are [Lenovo12] as. [Lenovo13]

65 [CT: APEC Economies will concentrate their work on the following Roadmap focus 66 areas.]

67 68

## 14 May DRAFTING NOTE: will delete reference to "secure" if this paragraph is accepted)

- 71
  72 1. Development of RUS:integrated, seamless, secure, trusted and innovative Renoval Adigital infrastructure
- 74 2. Promotion of Interoperability
- 75 3. Achievement of universal broadband access
- 76 4. [THA/US/CT/RUS: Development Adoption] [Lenovo15] of holistic government policy 77 frameworks for the Internet and Digital Economy
- 78 5. [CT Lenovo15]: PromotingPromote] greater [US:alignmentcompatibility] Lenovo17] of regulatory approaches affecting [Lenovo18] the Internet and Digital Economy [PRC] 80

  AlternativeTitle: Promote mutual understanding and strengthen cooperation in

(DRAFT Ver 08-23)

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

- regulatory approaches affecting the Internet and Digital Economy] [US:PRC AlternativeTitle:Promote mutual understanding and strengthen cooperation in regulatory approaches affecting the Internet and Digital Economy] [Lenovo19]
- 84 6. Promoting innovation and adoption of enabling technologies <a href="https://example.com/creations.com/regulations">[CT/PRC/MAS/RUS [Lenovo20] : , services, [MAS [Lenovo21] : and policies, and regulation] [Lenovo22].</a>
  - 7. [MAS: Ensuring Promotion] of trust and security in the use of ICTs
- 88 8. [[MAS: Facilitation Assurance\_] of cross-border data flows for digital trade and business activities[MEX: and E-Commerce]] [Lenovo23] [PRC Alternative Title: Promoting legitimatecross-border information flow for digital trade and business activities]
  91 [JPN AlternativeTitle/AUS: Promoting the free flow of information][US AlternativeTitle/AUS/CT/RUS: Enhancing cross-border data flows for digital trade and business activities] [ROK AlternativeTitle: Free cross-border data flows]
- 94 <u>9.</u> Establishment of baseline Internet and Digital Economy measurements 95 <del>9.</del>
- 96 10. Enhancing inclusiveness of Internet and Digital Economy [RUS:and relevant capacity97 <u>building</u>]
  - 11. [JPN/VN/US: Facilitation [MAS: Facilitation-Enhancement] of [MEX: -Promote] E-commerce and Digital Trade [Lenovo24] [PRC: and Digital Trade [Lenovo25]]

#### THE ROADMAP

101 102 103

104

105

106

98

99 100

87

[MAS:4n previous evolutions of network industries, ]APEC economies have seen the benefits that accrue through network interconnectivity and open participation, while recognizing the investment required for [MAS:network\_digital infrastructure] buildout [RUS:and the need for promoting adequate policy and regulatory environment to ensure sustainable growth of the Internet and Digital Economy].

107 108 109

110

111 112

113

114

115

[As we move into an Internet [RUS:and Digital Economy and a in information Digital] Society, where all sectors of economic and social development are increasingly empowered by the underlying digital infrastructure, [RUS/MEX:we recognize there needs to be recognition of the broad-based economic growth that is made possible [MEX:by this shift.] [Lenovo26] [Lenovo27] in all industry sectors and for businesses of all sizes including micro, small, and medium enterprises (MSMEs). Equally important is recognition of the social development made possible, including through policies and programs of inclusion and universal service access.]

116 117

[AUS Alternative Edits to Paragraph Above: APEC economies are increasingly influenced by the expanding As we move into an Internet [US: and Digital] E [Lenovo28] conomy and a [RUS: Information Digital] Society, where all sectors of economic and social development are increasingly empowered by the underlying digital infrastructure. We recognize,

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

there needs to be recognition of the broad-based economic growth that is made possible by this shift [US:, including, for example, in the financial sector, in the health and education sectors, in the agri- and aqua-culture sectors, and so on]. Equally important is recognition of the social development made possible, including through policies and programs of inclusion and universal service access.]

It is because of its very pervasiveness that *holistically* understanding the impact and *coordinating* the benefits deriving from the Internet and Digital [MAS:EconomyEconomies] has become so important.

## 1. Development of <a href="Integrated">[RUS: integrated</a>, seamless, secure <a href="Lenovo29">[Lenovo29]</a>, trusted and <a href="Integrated">innovative</a> <a href="Lenovo30">[Lenovo30</a>] digital infrastructure

The use of the Internet and of Internet Protocol (IP) standards for communications systems and other relevant international standards for technological products and services throughout the economy create the structural foundations for the Internet and Digital Economy. IP-enabled networks form the foundation of the Internet and Digital Economy; not just for Internet-based companies, but inclusive of all sectors of the economy that make use of the Internet or IP-enabled networks, taking into account views from the industry, including infrastructure operators. [AUS/MAS/US/JPN/CT: All member economies are encouraged to promote an enabling [MEX: a competitivean [Lenovo31] enabling] environment [MEX: and pro-investment policies that stimulate investment] for the development of quality digital infrastructure so as to develop internet and digital economy.][PRC Alternative Text to US/JPN Text: In this regard, member economies are encouraged to promote an enabling environment for the development of digital infrastructure. [Lenovo32] [RUS: In this regard, member economies are encouraged to promote an enabling environment for the development of digital infrastructure, with the quality required for the development of theInternet and Digital economy. | [Lenovo33]

### 2. Promotion of Interoperability

We acknowledge the key importance [MEX:to develop global technical standards that enable interoperability of interoperability as we move into an Internet and Digital Economy, where all sectors of economic and social development are increasingly enabled by underlying digital infrastructure. Digital technologies have the potential to provide local individuals and businesses with access to greater economies of scale and scope, through an open interconnected Internet and choice and competition among Internet-based platformsand applications. [MAS:

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

This will facilitate a transaction being made from any device to any other device, from anywhere in the world using solutions which are developed across the region]. We also recognize he high importance of the use and promotion of the multilingualism in the Internet and Digital Economyand underscore the need to support further development of [US: locally relevant local] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: [MAS: variety of languages and formats]] [US/AUS: on the Internet, while avoiding policies that result in localization barriers to trade] [PRC/RUS [Lenovo34]: [US/AUS: on the Internet, while avoiding policies that result in localization barriers to trade]. [MAS [Lenovo35]: We also recognize he high importance of the use and promotion of the multilingualism in the Internet and Digital Economyand underscore the need to support further development of [US: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a [AUS: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a localization barriers to trade] [PRC: locally relevant] content and services [AUS: locally relevant] content

#### 3. Achievement of universal broadband access

In 2000, we set the goal to triple the number of people within the region with individual and community-based access by 2005. Furthermore, the US: APEC Ministers Responsible for the Telecommunications and Information IndustryTEL ministers][Lenovo36] set the ambitious goal of access to next generation high speed Today, broadband access has become the broadband by 2020 in 2010. fundamental building block for the development of the [PRC:|internet and [RUS: Ddigital] economy, and this means ubiquitous, [MEX: affordable and] universal, access. It also means that quality of access is as important as access itself. This means ensuring basic levels of speed, availability, quality and affordability. Broadband access should be able to integrate economy and society through services to foster social and economic growth. [MAS: Given that mobile is the primary access to the Internet for all citizens today, technical resources including spectrum and numbering must be planned, allocated and used in the most optimum and efficient manner possible, through regional and global harmonization processes.]

## 4. [THA/CT/US/RUS: Development Adoption] of holistic government policy frameworks for the Internet and Digital [MAS: Economy Economies]

Given the cross-cutting nature of the Internet and Digital Economy, government policy frameworks should be developed holistically including agencies that are not traditionally seen as 'tech' agencies such as agriculture and fisheries,

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

manufacturing, competition, manpower, and so on. In order to capture and maximize the benefits of the Internet and Digital Economy, APEC economies are encouraged to coordinate with and involve public and private stakeholders so that [MAS:the Internet and Digital Economy#L] cuts across all sectors to participate in policy development.

5. [Promoting greater [US:compatibility Lenovo37] alignment-] of regulatory approaches affecting the Internet and Digital Economy] [PRC Alternative. Title: Promote mutual understanding and strengthen cooperation in regulatory approaches affecting the Internet and Digital Economy] [US:PRC Alternative. Title: Promote mutual understanding and strengthen cooperation in regulatory approaches affecting the Internet and Digital Economy [Lenovo38]]

A core problem facing both large enterprises and MSMEs is how to address legal and procedural uncertainties and to ensure compliance with an alphabet soup of general and sector-specific laws and regulations, as well as codes of practice and legal judgments. To accelerate the growth of the Internet and Digital Economy, member economies should promote mutual understanding and strengthen cooperation in regulatory approaches [AUS/US | Lenovo39 | i. including to international standards] [PRC:, including to international standards], while respecting economies' independent choice of policies which are consistent with their development situations and international legal obligations].

6. Promoting innovation and adoption of enabling technologies [CT[Lenovo40]/PRC/MAS/RUS[Lenovo41]: ,and services, and policies] [MAS:policies and regulations.]

[The development of the digital infrastructure [MAS:and including][US: smart manufacturing [US: Industry 4.0] [Lenovo42] [Lenovo43] opens new opportunities and brings new challenges for regulators and [US: businesses, transforming traditional approaches to regulatory and business cooperation in APEC. Due to the changing circumstances, public and private sectors should [US: share best practices cooperate [Lenovo44]] on the business transformation, paying particular attention to [MAS:trade and services in the Internet and Digital Economy.service industry and digital trade.]

[US: New dDigital] technologies [CT: and services], [MAS:and platforms] such as cloud

computing, and data services can provide governments with the flexible and efficient solutions for empowering future development [AUS/US | Lenovo45] | mitigating risk and addressing global challenges mitigating risk and addressing global challenges [CT:Effective measures should be encouraged to facilitate research and

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

development as well as investment in innovative digital technologies. Economies should take advantage of the internet to promote innovation in products, services, processes, organizations and business models. Economies also need to improve the business environment through policy frameworks that promote innovation in the Internet and Digital Economy.

[RUS Alternative text for focus/priority area 6: The development of the digital infrastructure and Industry 4.0 opens new opportunities and brings new challenges for regulators and business, transforming traditional approaches to regulatory and business cooperation in APEC. Due to the changing circumstances and rapid technologic development, public and private sectors should cooperate on the business transformation, paying particular attention to emerging digital technologies implementation. [Lenovo47]

Enabling digital technologies, [US: including but not limited to cloud computing, Internet of Things, Big Data, open data and data analytics, digital ID, artificial intelligence, quantum technologies, and other] [RUS: including but not limited to cloud computing, Internet of Things, Big Data, open data and data analytics, digital ID, artificial intelligence, quantum technologies, and other, [Lenovo48] can provide stakeholders with the flexible and efficient solutions for empowering sustainable growth while mitigating risks and addressing global challenges [Lenovo49].]

RUS: Effective measures should be encouraged to facilitate research and development as well as investment in innovative digital technologies. Economies should take advantage of the enabling digital technologies to promote innovation in products, services, processes, organizations and business models. Economies also need to improve the business environment through policy frameworks that promote innovation in the Internet and Digital Economy. [[LENOVOSO]]

[PRC Alternative Text for focus/priority area 6: Technological innovation in ICTs as well as innovation in ICT-driven economic activities is among the key driving forces of inclusive economic growth and development. New digital technologies, such as cloud computing, and data services, open new opportunities and bring new challenges for regulators and business, transforming traditional approaches to regulatory and business cooperation in APEC, and provide governments with the flexible and efficient solutions for empowering future development. Effective measures should be encouraged to facilitate research and development as well as investment in innovative digital technologies. Economies should take advantage of the internet to promote innovation in products, services, processes, organizations and business models. Economies also

(DRAFT Ver 08-23)

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

need to improve the business environment through policy frameworks that promote innovation in the Internet and Digital Economy.]

rus:

RUS Alternative text for focus/priority area 6: The development of the digital infrastructure and Industry 4.0 opens new opportunities and brings new challenges for regulators and business, transforming traditional approaches to regulatory and business cooperation in APEC. Due to the changing circumstances and rapid technologic development, public and private sectors should cooperate on the business transformation, paying particular attention to emerging digital technologies implementation.

Enabling digital technologies [US; including but not limited to cloud computing, Internet of Things, Big Data, open data and data analytics, digital ID, artificial intelligence, quantum technologies, and other,] can provide stakeholders with the flexible and efficient solutions for empowering sustainable growth while mitigating risks and addressing global challenges.]

In ICT-driven economic activities is among the key driving forces of inclusive economic growth and development. New digital technologies, such as cloud computing, and data services, open new opportunities and bring new challenges for regulators and business, transforming traditional approaches to regulatory and business cooperation in APEC, and provide governments with the flexible and efficient solutions for empowering future development. Effective measures should be encouraged to facilitate research and development as well as investment in innovative digital technologies. Economies should take advantage of the internet to promote innovation in products, services, processes, organizations and business models. Economies also need to improve the business environment through policy frameworks that promote innovation in the Internet and Digital Economy. [Lenovo51]

[CT:Effective measures should be encouraged to facilitate research and development as well as investment in innovative digital technologies. Economies should take advantage of the internet to promote innovation in products, services, processes, organizations and business models. Economies also need to improve the business environment through policy frameworks that promote innovation in the Internet and Digital Economy.]]

7. [MAS: Promotion-Ensuring] of trust and security in the use of ICTs

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

Whilst connectivity is key to the success of digital services, privacy and security are also a central consideration for building trust and confidence in the Internet and Digital economy. As the number of digital services has grown and the level of risk individuals users and providers are exposed to has increased, APEC economies recognize the need for accessible, open, interoperable, reliable and secure <a href="US:[Lenovo52]">[US:[Lenovo52]</a> environment for the use of ICTsenvironment] as an essential foundation for economic growth and prosperity. To meet these objectives, public and private sectors[Lenovo53] need to take advantage of the benefits of modern digital systems while keeping data safe.

329 330 331

332

333

334

335

321

322

323

324

325 326

327

328

8. [MAS: Assurance Facilitation] of cross-border data flows for digital trade and business activities] [PRC Alternative Title: Promoting legitimatecross-border information flow for digital trade and business activities] [JPN Alternative Title/AUS: Promoting the free flow of information] [US Alternative Title/AUS/RUS: Enhancing cross-border data flows for digital trade and business activities] [ROK Alternative Title: Free cross-border data flows]

336 337 338

339

340 341

342

343

344

345

346 347

348 349

350

351

352

353

354 355

356

357

358 359

360

[In today's [CT: datainformation]-driven economy, it is essential to [IPN: support the free flow of information to preserve the global nature of the Internet while respecting [Lenovo54] have frameworks for [RUS:data and privacy and personal data- Lenovossi protection, as they are crucial to strengthening confidence and trust in the digital economy[JPN: while preserving the global nature of the Internet]. The changes in technology and the flow of information has impacted how businesses cost-effective operate and provide services globally. interoperable[US [Lenovo56]: policy][HKC:[US: policy]]systems may contribute togreater digital inclusion for APEC economies, and support innovation and entrepreneurial growth. Economies should promote both effective [CT: datainformation][RUS:data and information privacy protection and the free flow of [CT[LENOVO57]: datainformation] in region, AUS: subject to appropriate public policy the Asia-Pacific exceptions [Lenovos8][Lenovos9] while respecting domestic laws and [US: regulationsregulators]] [PRC/US [Lenovo60] /VN/MEX [Lenovo61] while respecting domestic laws and regulations], applicable international frameworks for [CT: data information] privacy protectionin the Asia Pacific region][ PRC:, as stated in the APEC Privacy Framework]-APEC economies [HKC/CT: are encouraged toshould enable global, regional, and local organizations that collect, access, use or process data in the APEC economies to utilize mechanisms that]promote policies which ensure appropriate privacy protections for personal [information [RUS: as well as transparency and consumer protection][CT: data information]].[JPN: [Lenovo62]APEC economies [HKC: are encouraged toshould enable global, regional, and local organizations that collect, access, use or process data in the APEC economies to utilize mechanisms that promote policies

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

which ensure appropriate privacy protections for personal information]. [PRC: APEC economies are encouraged to continue exchanging views on digital trade by undertaking capacity building, developing case studies, and identifying practices, so as to bridge the digital divide and ensure all member economies' participation in digital trade, taking into consideration specific economic circumstances.]]

**Drafting Note:** HKC: Some amendments are suggested with a view to simplifying the paragraph.

Drafting Note: Proposed alternative text for "focus/priority area 8"

[Lenovo63] In today's information driven economy, it is essential for social and economic development of APEC economies to support the free flow of information while respecting applicable domestic and/or international legal frameworks for privacy and data protection, and strengthening security in the use of ICT as well as transparency and consumer protection. In this respect, APECeconomies recognize the importance of the APEC Cross Border Privacy Rules (CBPR)System, a voluntary mechanism whose participants seek to expand participation, and APEC economies support enhanced cooperation in this area, including through promoting capacitybuilding.]

[HKC/RUS] Lenovo64]: JPN: In today's information-driven economy, it is essential for social and economic development of APEC economies to support the free flow of information while respecting applicable domestic and/or international legal frameworks for privacy and data protection, and strengthening security in the use of ICT as well as transparency and consumer protection. In this respect, APECeconomies recognize the importance of the APEC Cross Border Privacy Rules (CBPR) System, a voluntary mechanism whose participants seek to expand participation, and APEC economies support enhanced cooperation in this area, including through promoting capacity building.]

#### 9. Establishment of baseline Internet and Digital Economy measurements

It is a challenge for APEC member economies to measure and monitor the development of Internet and [US:[Lenovo65]]Deligital] economy simply due to its[Lenovo66] the fast growth. APEC member economies expeditiously need to come together with relevant [PRC:stakeholders-parties] to define a better evidence base upon which better public awareness can be built, and more fully informed decisions can be made.[AUS/US:Taking into account ongoing work in other fora, APEC economies are encouraged to develop a descriptive glossary for the selected terms for the Internet and Digital Economy measurement. Different descriptions and interpretations of the

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

401

402

403

404

405 406

407 408

409

410 411

412

413

414 415

416

417 418

419

420 421

422

423

424 425

426

427

428 429

430

431

432 433

434

435 436

437

438

439

440

terms may lead to the wrong understanding of future initiatives and programs which in turn my slow down the process of APEC work in the field. [Lenovo67] [RUS:Different descriptions and interpretations of the terms may lead to the wrong understanding of future initiatives and programs which in turn my slow down the process of APEC work in the field. [Lenovo68] Taking into account ongoing work in other fora, APEC economies are encouraged to develop common understandings and improved baseline measurements for the Internet and Digital Economy, [RUS: based on the terminology accepted and implemented by the UN and ITU (International Telecommunications Union)] [Lenovo69]. These actions could be taken so as to [RUS: better capture the impact upon economic development,] effectively plan, prioritize and allocate resources, including technical resources, at the economy level, and coordinate frameworks at the regional level [RUS: and to measure and address economic divide, and particularly digital divide in the region].

## 10. Enhancing inclusiveness of Internet and Digital Economy [RUS:and relevant capacity building]

Considering the potential of ICTs to achieve the [RUS:UN Sustainable Development] Goal SDG, the Internet and Digital Economy can and should contribute to better inclusiveness in the APEC region to ensure that no one is left behind, including both in terms of social and geographic perspective. In this regard, APEC economies should promote policy measures and technical means to bridge the digital divides between and within economies, regions and groups, in addition to promoting universal broadband access. [RUS: In this regard, [Lenovo70]] APEC economies should take steps to bridge the digital gender divide, and ensure that digital strategies incorporate a gender perspective that addresses women's needs, circumstances, capabilities and preferences. Efforts should be intensified in development of awareness and digital literacy programmes, capacity building, and promotion of digital skills to build workforce capacity in the digital age. Policies should be promoted to support: and globalize MSMEs and individual entrepreneurs touse [US [Lenovo71] : of] ICT [RUS:technologies] to enhance productivity, nurture innovation improve competitiveness, and [RUS:their access][US [Lenovo72]: to remove barriers to the access of new markets. APEC Member Economies are encouraged toprovide better inclusion of disadvantagedgroups to leverage Internet and Digital Economy to improve their living standards and unleash their potential through effective use of ICTs, which will ultimately contribute in inclusive human resource development in the APEC region. We also recognize the high importance of the use and promotion of the multilingualism in the Internet and Digital Economyand underscore the need to support further development of [US: locally relevant local content and services [AUS: on a non-discriminatory basis] in a

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

[AUS:[AUS:variety of languages and formats]] [US/AUS:on the Internet, while avoiding policies that result in localization barriers to trade] [PRC/RUS:[US/AUS] on the internet, while avoiding policies that result in localization barriers to trade] [Lenovo73].

444 445 446

441

442

443

## 11. [JPN/VN/US [Lenovo74]:Facilitation[MAS:EnhancementFacilitation] of [MEX:-Promote] E-commerce and Digital Trade] [PRC:and Digital Trade]

447 448 449

450 451

452

453

454

455

456

457

458

459

460

461

462 463

464

465

466

467

468 469

470 471

472

[E-commerce and digital trade are among the fastest growing segments of global trade and have the potential to provide an extraordinary stimulus to the growth and trade of the Asia Pacific region as goods and services are increasingly transacted digitally. APEC economies are encouraged to elaborate and promote measures and policies aimed at effective development of digital trade and e-commerce through greater public-private dialogue. [APEC economies can identify building blocks and create a favourable digital ecosystem to facilitate e-commerce and digital trade including in areas such as paperless trading (eg. e-certifications, e-payments, e-signatures); expediting [CT:[CT: handling of]low volume, low value products; online consumer protection.][US[Lenovo75]: [APEC economies can identify building blocks and create a favourable digital ecosystem to facilitate e-commerce and digital trade including in areas such as paperless trading (eg. e-certifications, e-payments, e-signatures); expediting [<sup>CT:</sup> ] low volume, low value products; online consumer protection.] [AUS Alt. Text for Previous Sentence/US/CT: APEC economies can identify building blocks and create a favourable digital ecosystem to facilitate e-commerce and digital trade including in areas such as paperless trading, (eg. e-certifications, e-payments, e-signatures); expediting low volume, low value products; online consumer protection [PRC/RUS [Lenovo76] :; cross-border data flows; and location of computing facilities [Lenovo77] [PRC:US: ,and non-discriminatory treatment of digital products and digitally-enabled services, as well as avoiding the imposition of customs duties on electronically transmitted products].]] [US: ,and non-discriminatory [RUS: adeqautenondiscriminatory[Lenovo78] treatment of digital products and digitally-enabled services, as well as avoiding the imposition of customs duties [Lenovo79] on electronically transmitted products].][AUS Edits to US text:and non-discriminatory treatment of digital goods and services, as well as not imposing customs duties on electronictransmissions]. [Lenovo80]

473 474 475

476

477 478

479

480

481 482 [PRC Alternative Text for focus/priority area 11:E-commerce-and digital trade areis among the fastest growing segments of global trade and have the potential to provide an extraordinary stimulus to the growth and trade of the Asia Pacific region—as goods and services are increasingly transacted digitally. Efforts should be intensified to promote development of E-commerce for higher efficiency and reliability of regional supply chain, better connectivity, further integration of regional economy and modernization of MSMEs. APEC economies can identify building blocks and create a favourable digital ecosystem to facilitate e-commerce including by using trusted digital means such as

(DRAFT Ver 08-23)

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

paperless customs clearance, electronic transaction documents, mutual recognition of digital authentication, electronic payment and online payment.]

[US[tenovo81]:[PRC Alternative Text for focus/priority area 11:E-commerce is among the fastest growing segments of global trade and have the potential to provide an extraordinary stimulus to the growth and trade of the Asia Pacific regionEfforts should be intensified to promote development of E-commerce for higher efficiency and reliability of regional supply—chain, better—connectivity, further—integration—of—regional—economy and modernization of MSMEs. APEC economies can identify building blocks and create a favourable digital ecosystem to facilitate e-commerce including by using trusted digital means such as paperless customs clearance, electronic transaction documents, mutual recognition of digital authentication, electronic payment and online payment.]

### This section is under discussion.

### [ROADMAP IMPLEMENTATION

Specific APEC-wide activity to support the key focus/principles and specific actions

- Monitoring Elements [RUS/AUS/US: within the APEC fora, related to the Internet

- and Digital Economy development in APEC, which include but are not limited to the AHSGIE, Telecommunication and Information Working Group (TELWG), Electronic Commerce Steering Group (ECSG), Policy Partnership [Lenovo82]

\_\_

on Science, Technology and Innovation (PPSTI), Human Resources Development Working Group (HRDWG), Sub-Committee on Customs Procedures (SCCP), Small and Medium Enterprises Working Group (SMEWG), Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE), Group on Services (GOS), and Group of Friends on Disability Issues (GOFD), Committee of Trade and Investment (CTI), Economic Committee (EC) and APEC Senior Officials'

Meeting Steering Committee on Economic and Technical Cooperation (SCE).

### US Co-Convenor/AUS/JPN/CT/US [Lenovo83] ROADMAP IMPLEMENTATION<sup>2</sup>

## Specific APEC-wide activity to support the <u>key focus/principles priority areas</u>and specific actions

 The key/priority areas provide APEC with a guideway towards future work, but also a reference point to review past initiatives that contribute to the growth of the linternet and Deligital economy and to assist coordinating the broad range of activities related to the linternet and Deligital economy.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>Any future activities or topics suggested in the Roadmap Implementation section are based on collective inputs from APEC economies and do not necessarily represent the future policy positions of individual APEC economies.

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

- IRUS: The list of relevant APEC fora, related to the Internet and Digital Economy development in APEC, includes but is not limited to Telecommunication and Information Working Group (TELWG), Electronic Commerce Steering Group (ECSG), Policy Partnership on Science, Technology and Innovation (PPSTI), Human Resources Development Working Group (HRDWG), Sub-Committee on Customs Procedures (SCCP), Small and Medium Enterprises Working Group (SMEWG), Policy Partnership on Women and the Economy (PPWE), Group on Services (GOS), and Group of Friends on Disability Issues (GOFD), Committee of Trade and Investment (CTI), Economic Committee (EC) and APEC Senior Officials' Meeting Steering Committee on Economic and Technical Cooperation (SCE).]
- The Roadmap Annex includes a summary of past, current, and planned future activities in support of the [HKC: 11 10] key/priority areas identified in the Roadmap. The Annex should be seen as a living document and updated on an annual basis [RUS: by all relevant APEC fora].
- Relevant Committees, fora, and subfora are encouraged to consider the key/priority areas as they undertake activities to support the growth of the linternet and Deligital economy.
- In addition, APEC should consider a mechanism to coordinate and advance initiatives related to the internet and digital economy, while keeping in mind APEC's goal of streamlining its organizational structure current efforts of governance improvement Lenovo84]. [US: The E-Commerce Steering Group and the Telecommunications and Information Working Group [RUS:(TELWG) in accordance with their Terms of Reference and Strategic Action Plans] could jointly coordinate APEC initiatives relevant to the Internet and Digital Economy.] [RUS: ECSG will coordinate APEC initiatives relevant to e-commerce and digital trade, privacy issues, as well as customs procedures and general services, while TELWG will coordinate APEC initiatives relevant to legal and technical aspects of the digital technologies and ICT services development and implementation for economic growth in the APEC region, except for the topics, covered by ECSG.]The E-Commerce Steering Group (ECSG) could play this role. Given its current efforts to develop a Strategic Plan that will broaden its ecommerce initiatives, the ECSG is well placed to coordinate the implementation of the Roadmap.
- The Internet and dDigital eEconomy includes a wide range of work within APEC, with related activities in various APEC Committees, fora, and subfora. The APEC groups with relevant activities should include in their normal reporting process a section that identifies initiatives that relate to the internet

#### (DRAFT Ver 08-23)

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

and digital economy rus: and review the Roadmap Annex annually on the annual basis.

Recognizing the evolving nature of the linternet and Deligital economy,
 Initiatives are not limited to the Roadmap.

#### **Monitoring Elements**

- [AUS, PRC, JPN, US, VN,CT]: Relevant Committees, fora, and subfora are encouraged to include in their meeting reports to Senior Officials a section that summarizes current activities that support the 10-key/ focus areas identified in the Roadmap.] [RUS: Each APEC fora, listed above is encouraged to submit completed Roadmap Annex to ECSG or TELWG, which will consolidate an Annex to submit it to their parent committee (CTI and SCE respectively) on the annual basis together with the annual consolidated report. Each parent committee (CTI, EC and SCE) is encouraged to report on the APEC Internet and Digital Economy Roadmap progress in their respective sub-fora to SOM on the annual basis, providing Roadmap Annex, consolidated by ECSG and TELWG from the information, received from APEC sub-fora.]
- IRUS:TELWG is encouraged to to develop a template for a voluntary Internet and
  Digital Economy Individual Action Plan (IAP), which would reflect the needs
  and requirements of all member economies irrespective of the infrastructure
  and technological development level and show their progress in the Roadmap
  implementation and Internet and Digital Economy development.]

### [RUS Roadmap revision

This Roadmap could be revised every four years by the relevant APEC fora listed above upon their agreement. The proposals should be incorporated by SOM during by the end of the year of revision. Each APEC fora, listed above is encouraged to submit their proposals on the revision of the Roadmap to ECSG or TELWG, which will consolidate all the proposals into one document to submit the recommendations on the Roadmap revision to their parent committee (CTI and SCE respectively). Each parent committee (CTI, EC and SCE) is encouraged to send the consolidated recommendations on the Roadmap revision to SOM upon the endorsement of them at the committee level. SOM is encouraged to assemble the recommendations received from CTI, EC and SCE into consolidated revision of the Roadmap and bring it to the member economies for endorsement to present the revised Roadmap to the

APEC Ministers or Leaders during the APEC Leaders' week. Tentative Drafting

(DRAFT Ver 08-23)

**Document Version 8/23/2017:** This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

3	Group may be formed for compilation of consolidated revision upon the
)	decision of SOM.]
)	
	15 May DRAFTING NOTE
	ROK/US: To mention roadmap is living document at the preamble.
	RUS/CN: To include review mechanism, specify time lines
	CN: Role of AHSGIE not resolved. Proposal: List out scenario and presentoptionson
	who will implement and review the Roadmap. (1) transitional extension of the AHSGIE;
	(2) ECSG and TEL as coordinating working groups; (3) Friends of the Chair
	For this Roadmap, it will be useful to include the relevant gto help interpret and
	analyse where we are and identify gaps. To include timelines for review.
	US: APEC is bottom-up; leave it to the WGs to do the work
	Chair:Listing and presenting options and decide at next meeting; implementation
	Co-Convenor (CN): Some SOMs at SOM1 mentioned the possibility of setting up a new mechanism, e.g. FoTC. (Read the SOM Report)
	JPN: Agree with US and Co-Convenor (US) comments for the Roadmap
	implementation especially bullet points 4. A decision of the Roadmap should be taken
	in a consensus basis with member chair of the competent WGs in an open discussion.
	(No participants of chair from the competent WGs.
	Round 1 Intercessional Drafting Group DRAFTING NOTES
	CT/US: There are currently three different terms: key/[US/CT:focus]/priority areas. We
	have no special preference on using anyone of the three terms, but would suggest
	that we decide on one term to ensure the consistency of the wording throughout the
	document. Secondly, as for the 15 May drafting note: to "discuss China's proposal on
	providing a comprehensive and coherent framework by 202X," we would like to
	propose this issue to be handled by the designated fora/committee (or any other
	entity) which will take on AHSGIE's role on the Internet and digital economy issue from
	next year on. But if any economies insist on mandating the timeline in the Roadmap,
	Chines Taipei would then recommend that we put it in the year of 2020 because of
	the fast evolving nature of the internet and digital economy.

(DRAFT Ver 08-23)

Document Version 8/23/2017: This version is based on edits and comments received from the 2<sup>nd</sup> intersessional comment period. Please note that "Drafting Notes" from intersessional comments are highlighted yellow to differentiate new Drafting Notes. The existing "Drafting Notes" from the AHSGIE4 meeting are highlighted green.

638 639

THA: Proposal to consolidate focus/priority area 3 into focus/priority area 1. Universal broadband access is part of digital infrastructure.

640 641 642

643

MAS: Malaysia supports the principles outlined in the APEC Internet and Digital Economy Roadmap and takes note that there are still square brackets that need to be discussed and agreed upon by all member economies.

644 645 646

MAS: The Roadmap once adopted will be a guiding document for all economies.

647 648

MAS/PRC/RUS: The different level of infrastructure and technological development among member economies have to be given due consideration in the development of the implementation plan. [Lenovo85]

650 651 652

653

654 655

656

657

649

RUS: Russia supports the notes, proposed by Malaysia. Moreover, Russia would like to propose recommending TELWG to develop voluntary Internet and Digital Economy Individual Action Plan (IAP), which would reflect the needs and requirements of all member economies irrespective of the infrastructure and technological development level and show their progress in the Roadmap implementation and Internet and Digital Economy development.

658 659

Round 2 Intercessional Drafting Group DRAFTING NOTES: [Lenovo86]

660 661 662

663

664

665

666 667

668

669

670 671 PRC: Based on initial discussions at AHSGIE4 and SOM2 on the futurearrangements of the AHSGIE afterits current mandate expires this year, China has circulated a proposal for renewing the mandate of the AHSGIE for a period of 2 years until the end of 2019. We are of the view that, given the highly cross-cutting nature of the Internet and <u>Digital Economy, the holistic approach taken by the AHSGIE would be needed for</u> better synergies among relevant APEC fora and sub-fora, especially for implementing the Roadmap in a more coordinated way. Moreover, the mandate renewal would be the optimal way to strike a balance between the goals of ensuring the continuity of this important agenda and improving APEC's efficiency, as this approach could avoid <u>the establishment of a new mechanism, or introducing structural change to current</u> APEC sub-fora.